



## Re: QEAfate Calibration Presentation Comments

**Jessica Winter** to: Eric Blischke, Chip Humphrey, Robert Neely,  
Kristine Koch, Robert Dexter, Jennifer L  
Peterson

05/13/2010 11:00 AM

1 attachment



QEAfATE comments JWinter 5-7-10.doc

Hi Eric, Chip, Kristine, Bob, Jennifer, and Rob  
Attached are NOAA's draft comments on last week's modeling presentation.  
We also agreed with Earl's comments. If you have time this afternoon or  
tomorrow or Monday afternoon, it would be great to brainstorm a little  
bit about spatial scale for calibration & validation of the model.  
I'm at (b) (6) (cell phone; my work extension hasn't been  
transferred to my new office yet).  
Thanks  
Jessica

Blischke.Eric@epamail.epa.gov wrote:

> By the end of the week would be fine. Of course, sooner would be  
> better. At this point, we have not yet decided how we will transmit the  
> comments to the LWG and when. The scope and scale of the comments will  
> feed into this decision. Ultimately, we want to discuss and agree on a  
> path forward at our May 19th management meeting.

> Eric

>  
>  
> |----->  
> | From: |  
> |----->

>-----|  
> |Jessica Winter <Jessica.Winter@noaa.gov>  
> |  
>-----|

> |----->  
> | To: |  
> |----->

>-----|  
> |Eric Blischke/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Chip Humphrey/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Robert  
Neely <Robert.Neely@noaa.gov> |  
>-----|

> |----->  
> | Date: |  
> |----->

```

>-----|
> |05/11/2010 10:39 AM
> |
>-----|
> |----->
> | Subject: |
> |----->
>
>-----|
> |Re: QEAFate Calibration Presentation Comments
> |
>
>-----|
>
>
>
>
>
> Hi Eric,
> I have a couple comments that I'm in the middle of discussing with Rob
> Neely. I'm aiming to have them to you by the end of the week but could
> get them to you sooner if that would help. They have to do with spatial
> scale, biodegradation, a request for longer model runs (kind of
> overlapping with Earl's comments about the need for validation-- before
> we go forward with the model as a prediction of the future, we'd like to
>
> see how it behaves over time periods that weren't included in the
> calibration, especially because it appeared to be reaching a steady
> state concentration in the final few years of the calibration runs, and
> that might mean that the model is flatlining, or that there are some
> unique flow conditions or something special about those particular
> years), and a few requests for clarification on things they said in the
> presentation.
> --Jessica
>
> Blischke.Eric@epamail.epa.gov wrote:
>
>> Jessica and Kristine - Here are the comments we received from Earl on
>> the QEAFate calibration presentation. As we discussed at the end of
>>
> the
>
>> meeting, the LWG would like us to give them the ok to proceed with the
>> modeling. As I have mentioned, the model appears to be over
>>
> predicting
>
>> reductions in sediment concentrations. Earl has requested some
>> additional information/analysis to evaluate the adequacy of the model
>> calibration.
>>
>> My goal is to get back to the LWG with the following: 1) A concrete
>> list of information that we need before we can tell them to proceed;
>>
> 2)

```

```

>
>> Any changes that we want either based on the information request or
>>
> the
>
>> model presentation; and 3) Any caveats to the application of the model
>> (for example - the model results will be one line of evidence in our
>> evaluation of MNR in the FS). I think that Earl's comments cover
>>
> number
>
>> one and two (the validation comment). Chip and I can come up with
>> number 3. We are planning on discussing with the LWG on May 19th. Do
>> either of you have anything to add?
>>
>> Thanks, Eric
>> ----- Forwarded by Eric Blischke/R10/USEPA/US on 05/11/2010 09:41 AM
>> -----
>> |----->
>> | From: |
>> |----->
>>
>>
>----->
>----->
>>
>
>
>> |"Hayter, Earl ERDC-CHL-MS" <Earl.Hayter@usace.army.mil>
>>
> |
>
>>
>----->
>----->
>>
>
>
>> |----->
>> | To: |
>> |----->
>>
>>
>----->
>----->
>>
>
>
>> |Eric Blischke/R10/USEPA/US@EPA
>>
> |
>
>>
>----->
>----->
>>
>
>
>> |----->
>> | Date: |

```

>> |----->

>>

>>

-----  
-----|

>>

>

>

>> |05/10/2010 04:43 PM

>>

> |

>

>>

-----  
-----|

>>

>

>

>> |----->

>> | Subject: |

>> |----->

>>

>>

-----  
-----|

>>

>

>

>> |

>>

> |

>

>>

-----  
-----|

>>

>

>

>>

>>

>>

>> Eric,

>>

>>

>> Feel free to edit these comments.

>>

>>

>> Earl

>>

>>

>>

>>

>>

>> <<Comments on QEAFate calibration presentation.doc>>

>>

>>

>>

>>

>>

>>

>> Earl J. Hayter, Ph.D.  
>> U.S. Army Corps of Engineers  
>> Engineer Research and Development Center  
>> Coastal and Hydraulics Laboratory  
>> Vicksburg, MS 39180  
>>  
>>  
>> Duty Station:  
>> Clemson University  
>> 302A Lowry Hall  
>> Clemson, SC 29634  
>>  
>>  
>> Phone: 864.656.5942  
>> Fax: 864.656.2670  
>>  
>>  
>>  
>> (See attached file: Comments on QEAFate calibration presentation.doc)  
>>  
>  
> --  
> Jessica Winter  
> NOAA Office of Response and Restoration  
> 7600 Sand Point Way, Bldg 4  
> Seattle, WA 98115  
> Phone (206) 526-4540  
> Fax (206) 526-6865  
> jessica.winter@noaa.gov  
>  
>  
>  
>  
>  
  
--  
Jessica Winter  
NOAA Office of Response and Restoration  
7600 Sand Point Way, Bldg 4, Room 2117A  
Seattle, WA 98115  
Phone (206) 526-4540  
Fax (206) 526-6865  
jessica.winter@noaa.gov